

29 September 2022

For office use only Submission No:

Receipt Date:

Attn: Planning Technician Auckland Council Level 24, 135 Albert Street Private Bag 92300 Auckland 1142

**Submission on Plan Change 82: Amendments to Schedule 14 to Historic Heritage Schedule** Specific provisions that my submission relates to are: Chapter L

#### **Background**

Devonport Heritage Inc was originally formed in 1994 to celebrate and encourage heritage protection in the suburb and for 28 years has been a champion of the area's built heritage and history.

The society arose from a highly engaged community that since the 1960s, has been active in lobbying for the protection of Devonport's historic values.

Over the years the society has made numerous submissions at resource consent hearings, council plan changes and the Auckland Unitary Plan and is widely-recognised by council and residents as a forceful defender of Devonport historic identity.

It has 250 members, runs an informative website and holds events that celebrate restoration projects. A petition to 'Save Devonport's Special Character' has been signed by 2500 people.

## The Reasons For My Views Are:

- 1. Devonport is Auckland's most intact and historic marine suburb with a rich vein of Māori archaeology and early European history, much of it still visible. The two volcanic cones of Takarunga and Maungauika dominate Devonport and together with the timber houses and the coast on three sides, they present an enduring relationship between mountain, sea and housing.
- 1.2 This unique relationship between the geographic, historic and built heritage gives Devonport special status as a place of national significance that is widely valued far beyond the shores of the suburb itself. This enduring historic presence means Devonport is a significant built and cultural landscape area.
- 1.3 European settlement began in Devonport in the 1840s and the area progressed from a signal station and naval base to a farming settlement. It became the vital stepping-stone to the north and in the 1880s through to the 1920s it developed as a thriving business and residential hub in its own right.
- 1.4 From the 1880s it also became a popular seaside visitor destination for the people of Auckland and it was in this period through to the 1930s that most of the heritage buildings we see today were built.

1.5 For the reasons outlined above, Devonport Heritage proposes that the Devonport commercial area from Windsor Reserve to the top of the Victoria Road business area, should be an Historic Heritage Area and our proposal is attached. This has been prepared by heritage architect Jackie Gillies, landscape architect Richard Reid, conservation architect Jeremy Salmond and resource management planner Dave Serjeant. (Attached) We have also submitted this HHA proposal to plan change 78.

#### **Expectation For Protection**

1.6 The historic value of Devonport's buildings and houses has long been recognised, first by the Devonport Borough Council in its Scheduled Buildings Register and by the North Shore City Council in its District Plan from 1995.

There has therefore been a long-held expectation that Devonport's most historic buildings and houses deserve the highest level of protection.

1.7 We understand the Auckland Council's motivation for plan change 82 is to create an historic heritage schedule that is uniform across the city.

However we do not believe this acknowledges the regional significance of Devonport's history and the regional heritage value of the properties we list below.

## We seek the following decision by council:

## Accept the proposed plan change with amendments as outlined below:

#### 1.8 - ID 01113 Former Mays Residence 9 Mays Street Devonport

We oppose the B classification for the reasons that:

This grand Edwardian house was built in 1909 for Selwyn Mays a chief Crown prosecutor in Auckland at the time. He was the son of Oliver Mays a well-known early settler who arrived in Devonport in 1861 and became a school-teacher, shop-keeper and postmaster. He served on many public bodies over the years and Grey's Street was renamed Mays Street to acknowledge his service to the community. David Mason who was related to the Mays owned the house from 1926 to 1985 thereby retaining the family connection to the home.

The house is a landmark building in Mays Street with considerable aesthetic and architectural value. It is a 2-storey bay villa with a return verandah. There are distinctive cast-iron balustrades, fretwork and friezes. It also has timber decorative fretwork and eaves brackets with floral motifs. There are two Notable trees on the property that add to its visual appeal.

It is a well-preserved early 20<sup>th</sup> century house, aesthetically pleasing, of strong local, social and historic importance and has long been recognised as a major contributor to Devonport's historic value. The proposal to downgrade it to a B Historic Heritage place diminishes its importance in the eyes of the community and underestimates the contribution it makes to the overall value of Devonport as a regionally important historic place.

# Relief Sought: Classification as Historic Heritage A

# 1.9 ID 01118 St Paul's Church 100 Victoria Rd

We oppose the B classification for the reasons that:

The brick church was built in 1916 of a design by Grierson and Aimer, the third Presbyterian church on the site since 1850.

St Paul's has a grand street presence on the slope of Takarunga Mt Victoria which serves as a dramatic backdrop to this landmark building. The church sits beside its former graveyard, the earliest on the North Shore and beside

Francis de Sales church and together they are a strong visual link to the past. The churches and cemeteries display a significant aesthetic and historic statement on Devonport's main road.

St Paul's has a strong Arts & Crafts presence with its steep roof, splayed buttresses, bracketed porches and Romanesque arches over the windows and doors. The original exterior and interior are highly intact.

Since 2018 there have been plans to turn the church into a child-care business with major changes proposed for the church and its surrounds. Its listing as an A Historic Heritage place meant there would have to be a notified resource consent application in order to proceed. It was subsequently put up for sale.

Conservation Architect, Jeremy Salmond describes it as having "an exceptional architectural significance, being one of the finest examples of the Arts & Crafts style in New Zealand".

The present evaluation considers the church to have considerable social, historic, physical and aesthetic value. Yet the downgrading of St Paul's to a B Historic Heritage place fails to recognise this outstanding national architectural value and therefore its regional significance. This will also diminish the place in the eyes of the community and put it at risk of unsympathetic alterations.

## Relief Sought: Classification as Historic Heritage A

## 2. ID 01147 Shell path Queens Parade & King Edward Parade

We oppose its deletion from historic heritage for the reasons that:

The pathway stretches from the Calliope Dock to the Devonport Yacht Club with an interruption around Windsor Park Reserve. For environmental reasons the shell path is now paved with limestone chip. It has been in place since the 1880s as an area to promenade and meander and still serves this role today. The pathway includes the commemorative gate that celebrates the end of the Boer War and the coronation of King Edward VII in 1902. The path is adjacent to the commemorative sea wall and is an integral part of its extent of place.

The sea wall itself was constructed in two stages, the first stage in 1902. During the second stage, 1925-26, improvements took place, trees were planted and benches added to make the area more attractive and accessible. This reinforced the fact that Devonport was a seaside borough, a place to linger and enjoy. The Devonport Borough Council argued that the investment would 'create the most up-to-date seaside resort in the Dominion'. The word 'promenade' is often used in the early records. The council went to considerable lengths to prove that the stretch of land was a gift to the council from the Auckland Harbour Board in the late 1880s.

Without any good historical references, it has been assumed that the pathway's history is closely associated with the memorial sea wall. However, examination of old images used by Dr Derek Whaley for his project on the 1886 horse tramway, changes that perception. The short-lived tramway ran from the bottom of Victoria Rd, along the waterfront to Cheltenham beach. In several of these images a well-established pathway is clearly visible. It follows the contours of the present-day path.

Once thought to be commemorative in origins the shell path should now be assessed in terms of symbolism, tradition and history. It is a symbol of the will of early locals to have Devonport perceived as a seaside village, a notion still held dear.

It is one of the few significant soft pathways remaining in Auckland as a reminder of more humble times when not all surfaces were paved. The shell path is an integral part of Devonport's waterfront experience and has long been recognised as an unusual but authentic historic place deserving of it's a Historic Heritage listing. It also places it at grave risk of future unsympathetic hard paving possibilities.

Its deletion as an Historic Heritage place ignores its significant historic value and the aesthetic contribution it makes to Devonport waterfront's cultural and historic landscape.

# Relief Sought: Classification as Historic Heritage A

# 2.1 ID 01098 **Duder House 11 Church Street**

We oppose the proposed classification for the reasons that:

Duder House was built in the 1860's as three terraced cottages used as accommodation for the Masonic Hotel on land owned by Thomas Duder a signalman and early Devonport settler. His son Robert turned two of the cottages into a house and later established the local brickworks with his brother. The Duders were a prominent Devonport family and several local features are names after them. The family owned the house for 87 years and many descendants still live in and around Devonport.

The house is a one and a half storey timber Victorian cottage with Gothic Revival features, situated behind a wide garden. It has a symmetrical shape with two cross gables and a middle verandah. It has a distinctive steep, wooded-shingled roof.

Although there have been modifications over the years they do not detract from the pleasing aesthetics of the house which is a rare surviving example of early Auckland housing. For this reason together with its important association with an early Devonport family, it is of considerable social and historic value.

The downgrading to a B historic heritage place underrates its rarity value, its regional social and historic importance and diminishes the place in the eyes of the community.

#### Relief Sought: Classification as Historic Heritage A

2.2 The following amendments we seek, refer to four landmark buildings in the Victoria Road business area and should be considered as part of our proposal to have the area made an Historic Heritage Area.

Apart from the Victoria Theatre and the Esplanade Hotel these four buildings are the last remaining Historic Heritage A places, presently given A\* status.

Over the last few years several other Victoria Road buildings have been reclassified as B Historic Heritage without consideration of their importance to the whole of the area.

If different protections are offered to individual buildings, there is a real and serious risk that change to a lower-ranked building may have an adverse and cumulative effect on those that are more highly-graded, and equally, there is greater risk of cumulative adverse effects on the CBD as an historic entity.

The historical reality is that the CBD is itself the historic place, and the component buildings, which form the whole are integral to its value and significance. Each gives meaning to the collective whole. The current downgrading approach ignores the interdependence of these buildings - socially, architecturally and historically - for the integrity of the HHA.

The Victoria Road business area is of regional significance <u>in its entirety</u> and therefore must be considered as a whole and not solely by individual buildings.

#### 2. 3 ID 001122 Mays' Buildings 5-15 & 17-19 Victoria Rd

We oppose the B classification for the reasons that:

Built between 1870 and 1900 by Oliver Mays, this was one of the few buildings that survived the massive fire of 1888. Mays was considered one of Devonport's major early personalities. He helped establish the first local school and becoming a storekeeper and first postmaster. He was active in local politics for several years. In 1909 the building was extended to include number 5. Number 19 was added shortly after for the Dunning family. At least one of the three buildings is known to have been in place by 1885 because its brick construction is noted in

local newspapers as having prevented the spread of the fire southwards down Victoria Road.

It is a 2-storey brick building with decorative plaster broken into 5 bays and is the single largest building on Victoria Road. The central bay has a raised curved pediment and a trio of Venetian-style windows at first floor and a barrel-vaulted verandah at ground level leading to an arcade. The bays either side of it have plaster balusters at pediment, with deep plastered dentils supporting it, pairs of Venetian arched windows and string courses. The southern-most bay follows this pattern, but the northern one (number 19) is larger and is broken into two further

bays with plain rounded pediments and single windows per bay. Roofs are individual and hipped. A steel-roofed verandah with steel posts extends either side of the barrel-vaulted central bay along the street.

An arcade runs through the building at ground floor where some original features have been exposed and include a bakers' oven and kitchen range.

This building has significant historic value for its architectural form and its association with a prominent early settler and its landmark position as the largest and most significant building near the start of the main street. It is an important part of our proposal for Devonport town centre to be an Historic Heritage Area.

The downgrading to a B Historic Heritage place underestimates the outstanding contribution it makes to Devonport's commercial area which is of regional importance.

Relief Sought: Classification as Historic Heritage A

# 2.4 ID 01124 BNZ Building 14 Victoria Rd

We oppose this classification for the reasons that:

Built in 1926 and designed by Edward Mahoney & Son a prominent architectural firm in Auckland. It is in the 'stripped classical' style which includes many of the classical features associated with bank buildings in the country but in a simpler manner. Since the bank moved out in 1875 it has been a series of restaurants and bars, currently The Patriot.

The 2-storey brick building has strong classical features in brick and plaster. Four flat pilasters with Ionic capitals extend from an ashlar base at ground level to above the first floor. It has a deep cornice and plain parapet above. There are three windows at first floor, one in each bay and two at ground floor flanking the grand entrance doors. The windows are multi-paned at first floor and the entrance doors are double with deeply moulded panels. The exterior of the building remains intact and has outstanding architectural significance as the last remaining original bank building in Devonport.

It is an important part of our proposal for Victoria Road as an Historic Heritage Area because of its landmark position and its contribution to the wider streetscape of intact commercial buildings that date back to the 1880s. Downgrading the Mays Building to a B Historic Heritage place diminishes its local social and historic value which is significant. It also underestimates the contribution the building makes to the Victoria Road commercial area which is of regional historic value.

# Relief Sought: Classification as Historic Heritage A

# 2.5 ID 01134 Devonia Building 61 Victoria Rd

We oppose this classification for the reasons that:

Built in 1926 the Devonia Building was designed by Auckland's most prominent Arts and Crafts architects of the 1920s and 30s, Sholto Smith and Thomas Coulthard Mullions.

Their firm of Smith, Mullions and MacDonald were responsible for many residential and commercial in central Auckland and specialised in the use of ferro-concrete construction in residential buildings in the city, for example Chancery Chambers O'Connell St, Lister Building Lorne St and Shortland Flats. - The Devonia Building is a good illustration of their style, being a two storey commercial building made up of 4 shops and an assembly hall upstairs reached by a curved staircase. The room was designed for public and musical events. It demonstrates the Stripped Classical style typical of the inter-war years. It has been owned by the Returned Services Association since 1954 and used for their meetings and important public events since1947.

It's architectural value and its long use for public events and by the RSA gives it considerable social and historic value. It is a landmark building in Victoria Road with a strong street presence and is an important component of our HHA proposal for the commercial area.

The downgrading to a B Historic Heritage place undervalues its significance and the contribution it makes to the highly intact commercial area of Devonport which is of regional value.

Relief Sought: Classification as Historic Heritage A

## 2.6 ID 01136 Alisons' Buildings 73-79 Victoria Rd

We oppose this classification for the reasons that:

Built in 1906 as an investment property for one of Devonport's most prominent early settler families the Alisons. Alexander Alison and his wife arrived in Devonport in 1853 and played a major role in the shipbuilding industry. His son Ewen established and led the Devonport Ferry Company for 53 years and became mayor of Devonport and later Takapuna. A Devonport street is named after him. A fire in the 1930s led to three shops being redesigned by Clinton Savage, a regionally significant architect.

It is a 2-storey commercial terrace with decorative façade and shops below. The façade has exposed painted brickwork with tuck pointing and is divided into 3 bays with a wide Doric column pediment with the date 1906 at the centre. The parapet has four small truncated pilasters with decorative tops and a raised board with 'Alisons Buildings' at the centre. Other plaster mouldings include a cornice with small dentils, string courses, raised window surrounds to the upper half of the windows, flat panels between the windows and semi-circular detailed over. The windows are framed with moulded facings with stylised keystones at their tops.

There are three shops below with non-original glass frontages but some original features remain such as the panelled entry doors.

The building has outstanding significance because of its architectural value and its link to early settler personalities. It is of considerable local social and historic importance and has a strong aesthetic presence in the commercial area. It is an important part of our proposal for an HHA for the area.

Downgrading the Alisons' Building to a B Historic Heritage place diminishes its historic and social significance and the contribution it makes to the regionally important Devonport commercial area.

Relief Sought:	Classification as Historic Heritage A
----------------	---------------------------------------

-----

We would not gain an advantage in trade competition through this submission.

We wish to be heard in support of our submission. If others make a similar submission, we will consider presenting a joint case with them as at hearing.

Submitter Name: Devonport Heritage

Submitter Address for Service: 11 St Aubyn Street, Devonport

Contact Person: Margot McRae Email: mmcrae@xtra.co.nz

Phone: 027 5017477

Yours sincerely

Margot McRae Chairperson

Date 29/9/22